

ANALYSIS OF THE HEALTH EFFECT OF CARBON EMISSION IN NIGERIA

Akeem Olabanji Olasunkanmi¹

Centre for Petroleum, Energy Economics and Law, University of Ibadan, Ibadan, Nigeria. E-mail: a.banji@yahoo.com

Article History

Received : 14 February 2024

Revised : 11 March 2024

Accepted : 15 March 2024

Published : 28 June 2024

To cite this article

Akeem Olabanji Olasunkanmi (2024). Analysis of the Health Effect of Carbon Emission in Nigeria. *Journal of Applied Financial Econometrics*, Vol. 5, No. 1, pp. 27-39. <https://DOI:10.47509/JAFE.2024.v05i01.03>

Abstract: The quest for industrialization and economic competitiveness has drastically increased global CO₂ emission, including in Nigeria. The rising CO₂ emission apparently has implications for human health. Hence, this study examines the health effect of CO₂ emission in Nigeria using annual data from 1970 to 2022. The Toda-Yamamoto-Dolado-Lutkepohl (TYDL) granger causality test approach was adopted and the result showed no significant relationship between CO₂ emission and health indicators (life expectancy and death rate) in Nigeria. This counterintuitive finding is explained by the nascent stage of Nigeria's industrialization process. Thus, the study recommended that the Nigerian government and policymakers deploy alternative energy sources that generate less CO₂ emission and make them accessible, affordable and reliable to citizens. More so, the government needs to increase the budgetary allocation to the health sector to foster modern service delivery in the sector.

Keywords: CO₂ emission, Life Expectancy, Death Rate, Toda-Yamamoto-Dolado-Lutkepohl causality test, Nigeria

1. INTRODUCTION

The burgeoning global population together with the increasing quest for industrialization, among other economic activities, have led to the surge in carbon dioxide (CO₂) emissions globally (Balan, 2016; Rasoulinezhad *et al.*, 2020). The adverse effects of this growing trend, particularly on human health and environmental quality, have attracted the attention of researchers, policymakers and other stakeholders to assess the health effects of CO₂ emission at the country, regional and global levels (Matthew *et al.*, 2018; Agbanike *et al.*, 2019; Rjoub *et al.*, 2021). Pollutants being emitted in the air as well as in streams and lakes contaminate the drinking water and affect the local ecosystems directly. Changing the dynamics of an ecosystem disrupts the balance of organisms that provide clean air and food. Particularly, emissions from manufacturing plants and other polluting establishments affect humans directly by causing sickness

including different types of cancers, inflammations and heart diseases (Pope and Dockery, 2006). In this respect, energy consumption and environmental degradation have gained a large amount of attention worldwide as it is a huge challenge, not only for local areas but for the whole planet on a global scale.

Evidence reveals that emission-related diseases account for about 7 million deaths annually with the diseases ranging from cancer to cardiopathy and stroke (Oyelade *et al.*, 2022). Africa is not exempted from facing the adverse health effects of CO₂ emission as it causes more untimely deaths than childhood deficiency diseases, unsafe sanitation and unsafe water. Specifically, emissions annually account for about 712,000 death compared to 275,000 deaths, 391,000 deaths and 542,000 deaths caused by deficiency diseases, unsafe sanitation and unsafe water respectively (Dhrifi, 2018). The impacts of environment degradation on human health affect the society, both in terms of loss of quality of life and expenditure on health care. Therefore, health care expenditures due to environmental degradation and the studies examining the impact of CO₂ emissions are substantial. Greater carbon dioxide emissions are associated with more air pollution, which leads to health issues involving the lungs, heart and cardiopulmonary system (Davidson 2003). Countries with higher levels of carbon dioxide emissions, like Nigeria, would also likely tolerate higher levels of other harmful chemicals and pollutants, further increasing the risk of health problems among their citizens.

Nigeria, as an oil dependent economy, is not immune from adverse effects of CO₂ emissions. It is well established that all hydrocarbon extraction activities generate CO₂ emissions and one particular by-product of crude oil production is associated gas, the flaring of which generates large amounts of greenhouse gases (Afolabi, 2023). On the net calorific value, Nigeria's economy is fueled by unclean and traditional energy, comprising 80.9 per cent of the total consumption. Cleaner and modern energy like gas and electricity comprised only a paltry amount of 11.1 per cent (Rapu *et al.*, 2015). The sustainability of the energy systems in Nigeria is likely to be vulnerable if the anticipated energy crisis – in particular, the electricity crisis and CO₂ emissions issues – are not addressed appropriately. This is because the country is still highly dependent on fossil fuels such as oil and gas in its productive activities (Ogunjimi, 2020a, 2020b), which also represents other main causes of carbon dioxide (CO₂) emissions.

Moreover, the Nigerian government and policy makers make efforts to attract foreign direct investment (FDI) in a bid to foster economic growth and advance economic competitiveness. However, the pervasive weak regulatory framework in the country continues to hamper the efforts to control CO₂ emissions, which are often associated with the productive activities of multinationals. Developed economies often setup their industries in developing economies (like Nigeria) with weak environmental, regulatory and institutional frameworks, making the countries become pollution havens

(Odusanya *et al.*, 2014). Unfortunately, Nigeria, like other developing countries, lacks the requisite modern medical facilities needed to address the health challenges associated with CO₂ emission diseases given the meagre budgetary allocation to the health sector (Ogunjimi and Adebayo, 2019). Thus, the limited available resources that could be used for development purposes are expended on foreign medical trip at the expense of the country's development imperatives (Adeniyi *et al.*, 2022; Afolabi, 2022a). In view of this, it is imperative to assess the health effects of CO₂ emission in Nigeria in a bid to ameliorate the current economic situations with regards to the health sector and CO₂ emission intensive activities in the country.

The contribution of this study to the health-CO₂ emission nexus is twofold. First, the study examines the health effects of CO₂ emission in Nigeria using life expectancy and death as health indicators. Most related empirical studies either focused on the impact of CO₂ emission on life expectancy (Matthew *et al.*, 2018; Nkalu and Edeme, 2019; Osabohien *et al.*, 2020; Murthy *et al.*, 2021; Rjoub *et al.*, 2021; Mahalik *et al.*, 2022; Oyelade *et al.*, 2022; Rahman *et al.*, 2022) or provide empirical evidence on its impact on death rate (Rasoulinezhad *et al.*, 2020; Bressler, 2021), but not the two at the same time. A study of this nature is particularly rare for Nigeria. Second, most extant empirical studies on the subject matter ignored the possibility of causality between health outcomes and CO₂ emission as well as its direction (Odusanya *et al.*, 2014; Matthew *et al.*, 2018; Rasoulinezhad *et al.*, 2020). This study tests for causality between health outcomes (life expectancy and death rate) and CO₂ emission in Nigeria using the Toda-Yamamoto-Dolado-Lutkepohl causality test similar to what Rjoub *et al.* (2021) did for Turkey. The test for causality using this technique is important because of its robustness as it calculates an augmented vector autoregression (VAR) that ascertains the asymptotic distribution of the Wald statistics (Toda and Yamamoto, 1995).

The rest of this study is structured as follows: Section 2 reviews related studies on the relationships among life expectancy, mortality rate and CO₂ emission while Section 3 presents the methodological approach adopted in this study. Section 4 presents the analysis of the empirical findings while Section 5 concludes the study.

2. REVIEW OF RELATED STUDIES

In the literature, studies have also been extended to cover relationship between carbon emission and health indicators (Matthew *et al.*, 2018; Nkalu and Edeme, 2019; Osabohien *et al.*, 2020; Rasoulinezhad *et al.*, 2020; Bressler, 2021; Murthy *et al.*, 2021; Rjoub *et al.*, 2021; Mahalik *et al.*, 2022; Oyelade *et al.*, 2022; Rahman *et al.*, 2022). These set of studies underscore the possible impact of environmental pollution on health variables in single country and panel studies. In terms of empirical findings, Mahalik *et al.* (2022) examined the effect of CO₂ emissions on life expectancy in 68 countries between 1990 and 2017.

Findings revealed that CO₂ emissions attenuates life expectancy with the impact attributable more to consumption than production. Moreover, Oyelade *et al.* (2022) investigated how CO₂ emission affects the quality of life in Anglophone West African countries between 1990 and 2018. The panel quantile regression result showed that CO₂ emission from solid, gaseous and liquid fuels lowers the quality of life, measured as life expectancy. Murthy *et al.* (2021) also assessed the impact of CO₂ emissions on life expectancy in the D-8 countries between 1992 and 2017. The pool mean group result showed that CO₂ emissions has a significant negative influence on life expectancy. Matthew *et al.* (2018) assessed the impact of greenhouse gases on health outcomes in Nigeria between 1985 and 2016. The result of the autoregressive distribution lag (ARDL) model showed that greenhouse gases have harmful effects on human health as its increase, through increased human activities, reduces life expectancy.

Similarly, Osabohien *et al.* (2020) examined the effect of CO₂ emission on life expectancy in Nigeria between 1980 and 2017. The ARDL result showed that CO₂ emission lowers life expectancy. Another study by Narayan and Narayan (2008) found that carbon monoxide emissions and sulphur oxide emissions have positive effect on health expenditure, while Declercq *et al.* (2011) advised that life expectancy would increase up to 22 months if the major European cities can reduce air pollutions. Assadzadeh *et al.* (2014) found that increases in carbon dioxide emissions increases health expenditures, while a rise in life expectancy at birth decreases health expenditures in the short-run. Yazdi *et al.* (2014) examined the role of environmental quality and income in determining health expenditures (1967 to 2010) in Iran. Their study showed evidence that income, health expenditures and pollutants such as sulphur oxide and carbon monoxide emissions are co-integrated in the long-run. Moreover, their empirical findings showed that income and the pollutants are correlated with health expenditures in both the short run and long-run.

Also, Odusanya *et al.* (2014) studied the effect of per capita carbon dioxide emission on real per capita health expenditures in Nigeria from 1960 to 2011. They concluded that carbon dioxide emission increases health expenditures significantly in both the long-run and short-run. Similarly, Jaba *et al.* (2014) analyzed the relationship between the dynamics of the inputs and outputs of healthcare systems. Applying panel data analysis for 175 countries from 1995 to 2010, the authors found that health expenditure, as an input to the healthcare system, has a significant positive impact on life expectancy at birth. With regards to causality, Rahman *et al.* (2022) investigated the determinants of life expectancy in 31 world's most polluted countries and found one-way causality running from CO₂ emissions to life expectancy. In the same vein, Rjoub *et al.* (2021) investigated the causality among CO₂ emissions, economic growth, and life expectancy in Turkey between 1960 and 2018 using time and frequency domain causality techniques.

The result showed bidirectional causality between CO₂ emission and life expectancy while also showing a positive relationship between the variables contrary to a priori expectation.

On the nexus between mortality rate and CO₂ emissions, Rasoulinezhad *et al.* (2020) evaluated how mortality is affected by CO₂ emissions, fossil fuel consumption and economic factors in the Commonwealth of Independent States (CIS) region between 1993 and 2018. The result of the generalized method of moments (GMM) estimation showed that CO₂ emissions exert the greatest negative influence on mortality rate in the CIS region. Similarly, Bressler (2021) evaluated the mortality cost of CO₂ emission and found that CO₂ emission has a positive relationship with mortality rate such that mortality rate increases with increasing emission of carbon dioxide.

3. METHODOLOGY

3.1. Model Specification and Estimation Method

Taking cognizance of the ambiguity regarding the direction of relationship between the health indicators (life expectancy and death rate) and CO₂ emission, this study explores the relationship using a multivariate-based estimation technique, the Vector Autoregression (VAR) precisely. The VAR model allows for all variables to be treated as endogenous and therefore, there is no a priori distinction between endogenous and exogenous variables. Essentially, we favour a VAR model with the Toda-Yamamoto-Dolado-Lutkepohl (TYDL) causality testing approach, developed by Toda and Yamamoto (1995) and Dolado and Lutkepohl (1996), to determine the direction of relationship between CO₂ emission and the health indicators - life expectancy (LE) and death rate (DR).

Greater carbon dioxide emissions are associated with more air pollution, which leads to health issues involving the lungs, heart and cardiopulmonary system (Davidson 2003). Countries with higher levels of carbon dioxide emissions would also likely tolerate higher levels of other harmful chemicals and pollutants, further increasing the risk of health problems among its citizens (Balan, 2016). Thus, we would expect that as carbon dioxide emissions increases, life expectancy will decrease and there is potential of death rate increasing. There is also, the likelihood of healthy population constituting robust economic activity and consequently increasing carbon dioxide. It is this ambiguity of a priori regarding the direction of relationship between CO₂ emission and health issue that motivated our preference for causality testing technique.

Although there are others approaches to implement causality testing in the literature including a VAR model in the level data, a VAR model in the first difference data (VARD), and a vector error correction model (VECM), the simulation results by Yamada

and Toda (1998) suggests the TYDL model is relatively the more stable when compared to these listed alternative causality procedures. The main rationale behind TYDL is to artificially augment the correct VAR order, say k , with d_{\max} extra lags, where d_{\max} is the maximum likely order of integration of the series contained in the system. In the case of this present study however, we follow the TYDL framework and the given lag augmented VAR ($k + d_{\max}$) for CO₂ emission-economic growth nexus as below:

$$\begin{aligned}
CO_{2t} &= \alpha_0 + \sum_{i=1}^k \alpha_{1i} CO_{2t-i} + \sum_{j=k+1}^{k+d_{\max}} \alpha_{2j} CO_{2t-j} + \sum_{i=1}^k \beta_{1i} LE_{t-i} + \sum_{j=k+1}^{k+d_{\max}} \beta_{2j} LE_{t-j} + \sum_{i=1}^k \lambda_{1i} DR_{t-i} + \sum_{j=k+1}^{k+d_{\max}} \lambda_{2j} DR_{t-j} + \varepsilon_{1t} \\
LE_t &= \beta_0 + \sum_{i=1}^k \beta_{1i} LE_{t-i} + \sum_{j=k+1}^{k+d_{\max}} \beta_{2j} LE_{t-j} + \sum_{i=1}^k \alpha_{1i} CO_{2t-i} + \sum_{j=k+1}^{k+d_{\max}} \alpha_{2j} CO_{2t-j} + \sum_{i=1}^k \lambda_{1i} DR_{t-i} + \sum_{j=k+1}^{k+d_{\max}} \lambda_{2j} DR_{t-j} + \varepsilon_{2t} \\
DR_t &= \lambda_0 + \sum_{i=1}^k \lambda_{1i} LE_{t-i} + \sum_{j=k+1}^{k+d_{\max}} \lambda_{2j} LE_{t-j} + \sum_{i=1}^k \alpha_{1i} CO_{2t-i} + \sum_{j=k+1}^{k+d_{\max}} \alpha_{2j} CO_{2t-j} + \sum_{i=1}^k \beta_{1i} DR_{t-i} + \sum_{j=k+1}^{k+d_{\max}} \beta_{2j} DR_{t-j} + \varepsilon_{3t}
\end{aligned} \tag{1}$$

The multivariate VAR model in equation (1) would be considered where the two series are different orders of integration say I(0) and I(1), which is the case in the context of this study. The VAR specification can be further re-represented in matrix form as follows:

$$\begin{bmatrix} CO_{2t} \\ LE_t \\ DR_t \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} \delta_{10} \\ \delta_{20} \\ \delta_{30} \end{bmatrix} + \sum_{i=1}^k \begin{bmatrix} \delta_{11,i} & \delta_{12,i} & \delta_{13,i} \\ \delta_{21,i} & \delta_{22,i} & \delta_{23,i} \\ \delta_{31,i} & \delta_{32,i} & \delta_{33,i} \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} CO_{2t-i} \\ LE_{t-i} \\ DR_{t-i} \end{bmatrix} + \sum_{j=1}^{d_{\max}} \begin{bmatrix} \delta_{11,k+j} & \delta_{12,k+j} & \delta_{13,k+j} \\ \delta_{21,k+j} & \delta_{22,k+j} & \delta_{23,k+j} \\ \delta_{31,k+j} & \delta_{32,k+j} & \delta_{33,k+j} \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} CO_{2t-k-j} \\ LE_{t-k-j} \\ DR_{t-k-j} \end{bmatrix} + \begin{bmatrix} \varepsilon_{CO_2} \\ \varepsilon_{LE} \\ \varepsilon_{DR} \end{bmatrix} \tag{2}$$

The above three variables TYDL VAR approach modified the original bivariate form of Toda and Yamamoto (1995) to accommodate our variables of interest, where k represents optimal lag length determined using SIC while d_{\max} is the maximum order of integration. The direction of causality running from CO₂ to life expectancy (LE), from CO₂ to death rate (DR) and so on can be established through rejecting the null hypothesis which requires finding the significance of the Modified Wald (MWald) statistics for the group of the lagged independent variables identified above.

$H_{01} : \delta_{12,1} = \delta_{12,2} = \dots = \delta_{12,k} = 0$, implies that LE does not granger cause CO₂ emission.

$H_{02} : \delta_{21,1} = \delta_{21,2} = \dots = \delta_{21,k} = 0$, implies that CO₂ emission does not granger cause LE.

$H_{03} : \delta_{13,1} = \delta_{13,2} = \dots = \delta_{13,k} = 0$, implies that DR does not granger cause CO₂ emission.

$H_{04} : \delta_{31,1} = \delta_{31,2} = \dots = \delta_{31,k} = 0$, implies that CO₂ emission does not granger cause DR.

3.2. Data

Based on the empirical specification, annual time series was collected for Nigeria between 1970 and 2022. Health outcomes (HE_t) are measured as life expectancy at birth (years) and death rate (%) while CO₂ emission is measured as CO₂ emissions (metric tons per capita). The data are sourced from World Development Indicator of the World Bank.

4. EMPIRICAL RESULTS

4.1. Descriptive Statistics

The descriptive statistics, reported in Table 1, includes mean, maximum, minimum and the corresponding standard deviation statistics of the variables. The distributional properties of the variables are also examined via skewness and kurtosis statistics, while the Jarque-Bera test statistic is used to test for normality in the distribution. The variables are expressed in their level form with CO₂ emission averaging 0.64 metric tons per capita even though it ranged from 0.67 to 1.01 metric ton per capita for the review period. For health outcome variables, life expectancy and death rate averaged 46.4 years and 18.2 percent respectively. Confirming the slight difference in the maximum and minimum statistics is the corresponding low values of standard deviation statistics. With regards to the skewness and kurtosis, CO₂ emission and death rate are negatively skewed and platykurtic respectively while life expectancy is positively skewed and leptokurtic. The probability values of the Jarque-Bera statistics show that all the variables are normally distributed.

Table 1: Descriptive/Summary Statistics

<i>Statistics</i>	<i>CO₂</i>	<i>LE</i>	<i>DR</i>
Mean	0.64	46.39	18.16
Maximum	1.01	52.54	22.81
Minimum	0.67	40.97	13.07
Std. Dev.	0.33	2.74	2.42
Skewness	-0.11	0.40	-0.29
Kurtosis	1.99	3.04	2.74
Jarque Bera (P-Value)	1.99 (0.37)	1.18 (0.56)	0.74 (0.69)

Source: Author's Computation

4.2. Unit Root Tests

Table 2 shows the results of the ADF and DF-GLS unit root tests. The results are presented in two forms: model with constant and model with constant and trend. The

ADF unit root results show the existence of unit root in CO₂ emission for the model with constant but showed the existence of unit root in all the variables in the model with constant and trend. This implies that the variables have mixed order of integration in the model with constant but the same order of integration in the model with constant and trend. Thus, while the null hypothesis of, “there is no unit root” is rejected for life expectancy and death rate in the model with constant, the hypothesis is not rejected for all the variables in the model with constant and trend. Despite the importance of the ADF as the workhorse of unit root test in the literature, the low power associated with the ADF null against the stationary alternative, particularly when trend is included in the specification has been the major shortcoming of the ADF test. Thus, Elliott, Rothenberg and Stock (1996) proposed an extension to the conventional ADF and the outcome of the augmented ADF test which has come to be known as Dickey Fuller GLS (DF-GLS) show a significant greater power than the traditional ADF. In addition to the ADF test, the DF-GLS unit root test was considered to complement or provide robustness to the ADF result. The results show that life expectancy and death rate have unit root in the model with constant, thus, the null hypothesis is rejected. However, for the model with constant and trend, only life expectancy contains unit root. Thus, the stationarity of the variables hovered around I(0) and I(1).

Table 2: ADF Unit Root Test Results

Variable	Model with Constant					
	ADF			DF-GLS		
	Level	1 st Diff.	I(d)	Level	1 st Diff.	I(d)
CO ₂	-2.21	-6.86***	I(1)	0.22***	-	I(0)
LE	-2.28**	-	I(0)	-1.60	-3.99**	I(1)
DR	-5.26***	-	I(0)	0.95	-2.21**	I(1)
	Model with Constant & Trend					
	ADF			DF-GLS		
	Level	1 st Diff.	I(d)	Level	1 st Diff.	I(d)
CO ₂	-2.70	-6.79***	I(1)	0.10***	-	I(0)
LE	-0.55	-2.51**	I(1)	-1.03	-3.82**	I(1)
DR	1.17	-7.83***	I(1)	-5.91***	-	I(0)

Source: Authors' Computation

Note: The exogenous lags are selected based on Schwarz info criteria, while ***, **, * imply that the series is stationary at 1%, 5% and 10% respectively. ADF and DF-GLS represent Augmented Dickey-Fuller and Dickey-Fuller GLS (DF-GLS) Unit Root tests respectively. The null hypothesis for ADF and DF-GLS is that an observable time series is not stationary (i.e. has unit root).

4.3. Optimal Lag Selection

Given the sensitivity of Toda and Yamamoto Vector Autoregressive (TY-VAR) causality testing approach to the choice of lag length, we started our empirical analysis on the causal relation between CO₂ emission and health with a series of nested likelihood ratio tests on level VARs to determine the optimal lag length (p) prior to performing causality test based on TY-VAR estimates. Employing the Schwarz information criterion (SIC) to determine the optimal lag length, the preferred multivariate model for the analysis is presented in Table 3 as VAR (4).

Table 3: VAR Lag Order Selection Criteria

Endogenous Variables: Ln(CO₂) Ln(LE) Ln(DR)

Exogenous Variable: C

Included Observation: 31

	<i>LR</i>	<i>FPE</i>	<i>AIC</i>	<i>SIC</i>	<i>HQ</i>
0	NA	0.000149	-0.29508	-0.16711	-0.24917
1	287.1038	6.51E-08	-8.03651	-7.52464	-7.85285
2	158.7706	7.30E-10	-12.5366	-11.6408	-12.2152
3	71.33839	1.01E-10	-14.535	-13.2553	-14.0758
4	42.63862	3.26E-11	-15.7134	-14.04980*	-15.1165
5	16.43553	2.72E-11	-15.9664	-13.919	-15.2318
6	17.67517*	2.01E-11	-16.3886	-13.9573	-15.5163
7	11.13259	1.98E-11	-16.582	-13.7667	-15.5719
8	10.8924	1.88e-11*	-16.89844*	-13.6993	-15.75061*

* indicates lag order selected by the criterion

LR: sequential modified LR test statistic (each test at 5% level)

FPE: Final prediction error

AIC: Akaike information criterion

SC: Schwarz information criterion

HQ: Hannan-Quinn information criterion

4.4. Health Effects of CO₂ Emission in Nigeria

To estimate the chosen multivariate VAR(4) model via TYDL causality testing approach, we select the lag length 5 as our maximum order of integration (d_{\max}) and this is due to the outcomes of our unit root testing result, where the series order of integration are revealed as mixture of I(0) and I(1). Table 4 presents the causality testing results on CO₂ emission–health relationship. For the period under consideration, the result shows no significant relationship between CO₂ emission and life expectancy, indicating that CO₂ emission does not granger cause life expectancy and vice versa. Empirical evidences have shown that CO₂ emission has several health hazards and associated health

conditions, which are potent enough to reduce life expectancy (Osabohien *et al.*, 2020; Rjoub *et al.*, 2021; Oyelade *et al.*, 2022). Similarly, the result shows that CO₂ emission does not exert a significant influence on death rate in Nigeria, that is CO₂ emission does not instigate death in Nigeria. This result is counterintuitive as a priori expectation and empirical evidences show that many deaths have been linked to the inhalation of CO₂ emission, which has as well led to the continual depletion of the ozone layer (Bressler, 2021).

Overall, the causality testing result indicated no evidence of significant causal relationship between the CO₂ emission and the health indicators considered. This in particular, contradicts Davidson's (2003) and Murthy *et al.*'s (2020) assertion that carbon dioxide emissions are associated with more air pollution leading to health issues involving the lungs, heart and cardiopulmonary system. Such lack of causal relationship may yet be attributable to the developing characteristic of the investigated economy where industrialization process of growth and development is still very much at the premature stage (Afolabi, 2022b).

Table 4: Toda-Yamamoto-Dolado-Lutkepohl VAR Granger Causality Result

<i>Equation Variable</i>	<i>Equation 1</i> <i>Ln(CO₂)</i>	<i>Equation 2</i> <i>Ln(LE)</i>	<i>Equation 3</i> <i>Ln(DR)</i>
Ln(CO ₂)	D.V	2.43 (0.6571)	1.67 (0.7966)
Ln(LE)	6.19 (0.1851)	D.V	49.16*** (0.0000)
Ln(DR)	7.03 (0.1341)	22.24*** (0.0002)	D.V

Note: D.V. denotes dependent variable and the probability values are in parentheses while ***, **, and * indicates significance at 1%, 5% and 10%.

5. CONCLUDING SUMMARY

Several attempts have been made to assess the health effects of CO₂ emissions in developed and developing economies. However, most of the studies used either life expectancy or mortality rate as the measure of health outcome and not the two variables together. Moreover, studies on the subject matter is particularly rare for Nigeria, which is one of the top emitter of carbon in Africa. Therefore, this study evaluated the health effect of CO₂ emission in Nigeria from 1970 to 2022. The Toda-Yamamoto-Dolado-Lutkepohl granger causality test was adopted to evaluate this relationship, particularly to determine the direction of causality between CO₂ emission and the selected health indicators. The empirical result showed the absence of causal relationship between CO₂ emission and the duo of life expectancy and death rate in Nigeria. This finding is counterintuitive, especially for a high carbon-emitting country like Nigeria. Nonetheless, it clearly signals the nascent stage of the country's industrialization process.

Based on this finding, this study recommends that the Nigerian government and policymakers should keep CO₂ emission at bay while also deploying alternative energy sources that generate less CO₂ emission. This will not only help in improving the health and wellbeing of citizens together with life expectancy but also foster sustainable economic growth in the country. More importantly, the alternative energy source must be made accessible, affordable and reliable to facilitate its acceptance. In addition, government need to increase the budgetary allocation to the health sector to empower the sector to procure state-of-the-art medical facilities in a bid to provide modern medical services to residents or visitors in the country.

References

- Adeniyi, O., Afolabi, J., Adekunle, W., Babatunde, M., & Omiwale, E. (2022). Savings-investment gaps in Sub-Saharan Africa: Does the interaction of financial development and migrant remittances matter? *Central Bank of Nigeria Journal of Applied Statistics*, 13(2), 223-255. DOI: 10.33429/Cjas.13222.7/7
- Afolabi, J.A. (2023). Natural resource rent and environmental quality nexus in Sub-Saharan Africa: Assessing the role of regulatory quality. *Resources Policy*, 82(103488), 1-11. DOI: 10.1016/j.resourpol.2023.103488
- Afolabi, J.A. (2022a). Financial Development, Trade Openness and Economic Growth in Nigeria. *Iranian Economic Review*, 26(1): 237-254.
- Afolabi, J.A. (2022b). Diversification towards industrialization: A pathway to building a resilient Nigerian economy. *Economic and Policy Review Journal*, 20(2), 8-14.
- Afolabi, J. and Ogunjimi, J.A. (2020). Industrialization: A roadmap to inclusive growth in Nigeria. *Economics and Policy Review Journal*, 18(1), 20-28.
- Agbanike, T.F., Nwani, C., Uwazie, U., Uma, K.E., Anochiwa, L., Igberi, C. and Ogbonnaya, I.O. (2019). Oil, Environmental Pollution and Life Expectancy in Nigeria. *Appl. Ecol. Environ. Res.*, 17, 11143-11162.
- Assadzadeh, A., Bastan, F. and Shahverdi, A. (2014). *The Impact of Environmental Quality and Pollution on Health Expenditures: A Case Study of Petroleum Exporting Countries*. Proceedings of 29th International Business Research Conference, 24 – 25 November 2014, Sydney, Australia.
- Balan, F. (2016). Environmental quality and its human health effects: A causal analysis for the EU-25. *International Journal of Applied Economics*, 13, 57-71.
- Bressler, R.D. (2021). The mortality cost of carbon. *Nature Communications*, DOI: 10.1038/s41467-021-24487-w OPEN
- Davidson, C. (2003). Marine Notice: Carbon Dioxide: Health Hazard. *Australian Maritime Safety Authority*, 7.

- Declercq, B., Delarue, E. and D'Haeseleer, W. (2010). Impact of the Economic Recession on the European Power Sector's CO₂ Emissions. *Energy Policy*, 39 (3), 1667-1686.
- Dhrifi, A. (2018). Does Environmental Degradation, Institutional Quality, and Economic Development Matter for Health? Evidence from African Countries. *Journal of the Knowledge Economy*, 1-16.
- Dolado, J.J. and Lutkepohl, H. (1996). Making Wald Tests Work for Cointegrated VAR Systems. *Econometric Reviews*, 15(4), 369-386.
- Elliott, G., Rothenberg, T. and Stock, J.H. (1996). Efficient Test for an Autoregressive Unit Root. *Econometrica*, 64(4), 813-836.
- Jaba, E., Balan, C.B. and Robu, I. (2014). The relationship between life expectancy at birth and health expenditures estimated by a cross-country and time-series analysis. *Procedia Economics and Finance*, 15: 108 – 114.
- Mahalik, M.K., Le, T., Le, H. and Mallick, H. (2022). How do sources of carbon dioxide emissions affect life expectancy? Insights from 68 developing and emerging economies. *World Development Sustainability*, DOI: 10.1016/j.wds.2022.100003
- Matthew, O., Osabohien, R., Fasina, F. and Fasina, A. (2018). Greenhouse Gas Emissions and Health Outcomes in Nigeria: Empirical Insight from ARDL Technique. *International Journal of Energy Economics and Policy*, 8(3), 43-50.
- Murthy, U., Shaari, M.S., Mariadas, P.A. and Abidin, N.Z. (2021). The Relationships between CO₂ Emissions, Economic Growth and Life Expectancy. *Journal of Asian Finance, Economics and Business*, 8(2), 801-808. DOI: 10.13106/jafeb.2021.vol8.no2.0801
- Narayan, P.K. and Smyth, R. (2008). Energy consumption and real GDP in G7 countries: new evidence from panel cointegration with structural breaks. *Energy Economics*, 30(5), 2331-2341.
- Nkalu, C.N. and Edeme, R.K. (2019). Environmental hazards and life expectancy in Africa: Evidence from GARCH Model. *SAGE Open*, 9(1), 2158244019830500.
- Odusanya, I.A., Adegboyega, S.B. and Kuku, M.A. (2014). Environmental quality and health care spending in Nigeria. *Fountain Journal of Management and Social Sciences*, 3(2), 57-67.
- Odusanya, I.A., Adegboyega, S.B., Kuku, M.A. (2014). Environmental Quality and Health Care Spending in Nigeria. *Fountain Journal of Management and Social Sciences*, 3(2), 57-67.
- Ogunjimi, J.A. (2020a). Oil Price Asymmetry and Sectoral Output in Nigeria. *International Journal of Economics, Business and Management Studies*, 7(1): 1-15. DOI: 10.20448/802.71.1.15
- Ogunjimi, J.A. (2020b). Exchange rate dynamics and sectoral output in Nigeria: A symmetric and asymmetric approach. *American Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities*, 5(1), 178-193. DOI: 10.20448/801.51.178.193
- Ogunjimi, J.A. and Adebayo, A.O. (2019). Health Expenditure, Health Outcomes and Economic Growth in Nigeria. *Asian Journal of Economics and Empirical Research*, 6(2), 130-139. DOI: 10.20448/journal.501.2019.62.130.139

- Osabohien, R., Ayomitunde, A.T., Bose, A.D. and Ifeanyi, O.J (2020). Carbon Emissions and Life Expectancy in Nigeria. *Research Square*, DOI: 10.21203/rs.3.rs-80181/v1
- Oyelade, A.O., Maku, O.E. and Oladimeji, O. (2022). The Effect of CO2 Emissions on Quality of Life in Anglophone Countries in West Africa. *African Journal of Economic Review*, 10(1), 27-41.
- Pope, C.A. and Dockery, D.W. (2006). Health effects of fine particulate air pollution: lines that connect. *Journal of the air and waste management association*, 56(6), 709-742.
- Rahman, M.M, Rana, R., Khanam, R. (2022). Determinants of life expectancy in most polluted countries: Exploring the effect of environmental degradation. *PLoS ONE*, 17(1), 1-16. DOI: 10.1371/journal.pone.0262802
- Rapu, C.S., Adenuga, A.O., Kanya, W.J., Abeng, M.O., Golit, P.D., Hilili, M.J., Uba, I.A. and Ochu, E.R. (2015). Analysis of energy market conditions in Nigeria. *Central Bank of Nigeria Occasional Paper No. 55*, October 2015.
- Rasoulinezhad, E., Taghizadeh-Hesary, F. and Taghizadeh-Hesary, F. (2020). How Is Mortality Affected by Fossil Fuel Consumption, CO2 Emissions and Economic Factors in CIS Region? *Energies*, 13, 2255. DOI: 10.3390/en13092255
- Rjoub, H., Odugbesan, J.A., Adebayo, T.S. and Wong, W.K. (2021). Investigating the Causal Relationships among Carbon Emissions, Economic Growth, and Life Expectancy in Turkey: Evidence from Time and Frequency Domain Causality Techniques. *Sustainability*, 13, 2924. DOI: 10.3390/su13052924
- Toda, H.Y. and Yamamoto, T. (1995). Statistical inference in vector autoregressions with possibly integrated processes. *Journal of Econometrics*, 66, 225-250.
- Yazdi, S., Tamhmasebi, Z. and Mastorakis, N. (2014). Public Healthcare Expenditure and Environmental Quality in Iran. In *Recent Advances in Applied Economics, Proceedings of the 6th International Conference on Applied Economics, Business and Development, Business and Economics Series*, 16, 126-134.